

The Dokdo/Takeshima Controversy

Study Based on Historical Materials

Park Byoung-sup and Naitō Seichū
Translated by National Assembly Library
Republic of Korea



NATIONAL ASSEMBLY LIBRARY

Message from the Publisher

We have witnessed conflicts between Korea and Japan occur virtually every year over the sovereignty of Dokdo. However, from an outsider's perspective, Dokdo can erroneously appear to simply be a cluster of barren rocks over which the point of controversy might be ambiguous. Against this backdrop, the National Assembly Library of the Republic of Korea came up with a plan to translate and publish quality literatures containing the history and relevant information regarding Dokdo in English with the objective to reduce unnecessary friction between Korea and Japan, and shed light on the relatively unknown history of Dokdo to the rest of the world.

In this vein, the National Assembly Library established a consultancy committee composed of experts on the Dokdo issue, ranging from historians to oceanography experts, and international law scholars. Through in-depth discussions with the above experts, we selected literatures to be translated in English. *The Dokdo/Takeshima Controversy* is the first outcome of these efforts.

The original version of this book is *The Dokdo/Takeshima Controversy* (Shinkansha, 2007). It is co-authored by honorary professor of the Shimane University, Naitō Seichū, who is a Japanese Dokdo expert, and Park Byoung-sup, who is a Korean resident in Japan specializing on the Dokdo issue. The original Japanese edition was selected by the Japanese Library Association as a recommendable book in 2007, and its Korean edition translated by Hosaka Yuji, professor of Sejong University in Korea, was also designated as an outstanding book by the Korean National Academy of Sciences in 2009.

Published by the National Assembly Library of the Republic of Korea
Yoo Jong Pil, Chief Librarian of the National Assembly Library
1 Uisadang-ro, Yeongdeungpo-gu, Seoul, 150-703, Republic of Korea
www.nanet.go.kr

Copyright © 2009 by the National Assembly Library
Publications Registration No. 31-9720077-000697-01

All rights reserved. No part of this work may be used or reproduced in any manner whatsoever without the prior permission of the National Assembly Library of the Republic of Korea.

The cover photo is provided courtesy of the Province of Gyeongsangbuk-do.

In an effort to be faithful to the authors' original intention, our English translation was based on the Japanese edition. In addition, in order to secure accuracy and completeness of the work, the English translation was reviewed by the co-author Park Byoung-sup, as well as by Han Sang-bok, who is a Dokdo expert serving as adviser to the Dokdo Resource Center of the National Assembly Library.

This book can be characterized by its in-depth analysis and interpretation based on official historical materials available in Korea, Japan, and the United States. It contains accurate analysis of the "Dajōkan's Decree," which was the highest state institution of the Meiji government in Japan. Also, *The Brief Map of Isotakeshima* attached to "Dajōkan's Decree," which was first disclosed in 2006, is one of the new references, along with descriptions by Reverend Urushizaki Hideyuki, of the Kanazawa Church in Japan, on how he discovered the material, the actual original text of the material, and his comments on the text. In addition, this book also includes the original Japanese text of *A Memorandum Concerning the Arrival of a Korean Boat to the Seashore in the 9th Year of the Genroku*, in which Japanese officials took note of what Ahn Yong-bok and his companions said to Japanese officials in May 1696 after their arrival in Oki, Japan.

It is my hope that this book will serve as a means for sharing accurate information regarding the history of Dokdo. The National Assembly Library will continue to seek outstanding Dokdo-related literatures and publish their English editions in a systematic way so that the international community can share accurate understanding regarding the Dokdo issue.

October 2009

Yoo Jong Pil

Chief Librarian of the National Assembly Library, ROK

Preface to Japanese Edition

There is a saying in Korea that it only takes a day for US-Japan relations to mend even during hostile times, but as for Korea-Japan relations, it only takes a day to turn sour even during friendly times. Today, thanks to sustained bilateral exchange and cooperation activities, Korea-Japan relations have come a long way since bygone times. Nonetheless, the risk of our bilateral relations turning "sour in a day" still remains.

The territorial disagreement over Dokdo/Takeshima is an issue saturated with potential to turn Korea-Japan relations "sour in a day." It is discussion topic that can easily stimulate narrow-minded chauvinism and escalate into unexpected social disorder at any moment. Right before the signing of the Korea-Japan Treaty on Basic Relations (1965), Korean Foreign Minister Lee Dong-won likened the Dokdo/Takeshima issue to dynamite that can ignite an explosion of heated sentiment in Korea. The news that the Shimane Prefectural Office of Japan enacted an ordinance designating February 22 as Takeshima (Dokdo) Day in 2005 infuriated the Korean people. In 2006, patrol boats of the two countries came dangerously close to a crisis-like situation when they confronted each other over the issue of ocean research near Dokdo/Takeshima.

In instances such as illustrated above, the Japanese Foreign Ministry applies the term "Japan's inherent territory" for Dokdo/Takeshima. This demonstrates how it gives little heed to the results of recent studies concerning the island. The contention of the Japanese regarding ownership over Dokdo/Takeshima began about half a century ago during a time when the history of the island was not yet well known. Today, even the Shimane Prefectural Office of Japan, which enacted an ordinance

designating Takeshima (Dokdo) Day, does not use the term "Japan's inherent territory" for Dokdo/Takeshima, at least on its website. However, it does still contend that the island has "belonged to Japan *historically*."

One can suppose that the Shimane Prefectural Office takes this stance because it holds in high regard historical accounts regarding Dokdo/Takeshima passed on from the Meiji Era (1868-1912). However, the truth of the matter is that the Dajōkan of Japan in actuality gave orders for Dokdo/Takeshima to be understood as having nothing to do with Japan in 1877 during the Meiji Era. This record verifies that the application of the term "Japan's inherent territory" as inaccurate and improper. Even so, such details regarding records from the Meiji Era is hardly known to the ordinary public.

The common Japanese is not aware of the fact that Dokdo/Takeshima was in actuality referred to as Matsushima, and that Ulleungdo was the island referred to as Takeshima during the Edo Era (1603-1867). Matsushima means "pine tree island" and Takeshima means "bamboo island." Not a single pine tree grows on Matsushima, but it was called so due to the thought that it makes a "good couple" with the nearby Takeshima. ("Pine" and "bamboo" make a lucky pair in Japan.)

Because of an incorrect map made in Europe during the Meiji Era, Ulleungdo came to be called Matsushima, while Dokdo/Takeshima was termed "Liancourt Rocks." This demonstrates that the Japanese did not hold the belief that Dokdo/Takeshima was their inherent territory. It is common for the mainstream public to pay little or no attention to these historical facts.

Throughout the years, Japan has referred to Dokdo/Takeshima and Ulleungdo as follows:

Dokdo/Takeshima

Edo Era (1603-1867): "Matsushima"

Meiji Era (prior to 1905): "Matsushima" or "Liancourt Rocks" or "Ryanko" or "Yanko" or "Hornet"

Post 1905 (After its incorporation into Japanese territory in 1905): Mostly "Takeshima"

Ulleungdo

Edo Era (1603-1867): "Takeshima" or "Isotakeshima"

Meiji Era: "Takeshima," then gradually changed to "Matsushima" in or about 1880

Post 1905: Gradually changed to "Ulleungdo"

This book intends to help reduce meaningless frictions between the two countries by shedding light on the history of Dokdo/Takeshima generally not known to ordinary people. Recently, new facts concerning Dokdo/Takeshima have been found as a result of exploration of historical documents, supposedly stimulated by an article by Kyoto University's Professor Horii Kazuo in 1987 concerning the Dajōkan's Decree of 1877 (See Section 2, Chapter V) during the Meiji Era. This book contains revised versions of articles written by Naitō Seichū and Park Byoung-sup published in journals and on the Internet.

The Brief Map of Isotakeshima attached to Dajōkan's Decree has recently been disclosed by Reverend Urushizaki Hideyuki of Kanazawa Church in Japan. His explanation on how he found the map is enclosed in Section 2 of Chapter V of this book. The author is indebted to him and Ms. Gin Ryushi (a Japanese who contributed to *A Travelogue about a Visit to Ulleungdo and Takeshima/Dokdo* after paying a visit to Dokdo/Takeshima) for helping the author to have a clear picture of the local situation from within Japan.

The author welcomes readers' opinions, including straightforward criticisms via e-mail (half-moon@muj.biglobe.ne.jp). Thank you.

Park Byoung-sup

Preface to English Edition

Korea and Japan are in dispute regarding territorial rights over Dokdo/Takeshima, which is geographically located between the two countries, and over which Korea exercises effective control following WWII. However, Japan has laid sovereign claim on the island since the 1950's, and conflict over this issue has peaked to intense tensions on several occasions.

The Dokdo/Takeshima Controversy (竹島=獨島論争 : 歴史資料から考える) was published against this backdrop in 2007 by Shinkansha (Tokyo) in Japanese to assist the better understanding of the Dokdo/Takeshima issue that has notoriously hindered Korea-Japan relations.

I myself am a Korean resident in Japan, while co-author of the book, Naitō Seichū, is Japanese, but we both focused on the territorial sovereignty issue from a factual perspective regardless of our nationalities. Such efforts made possible the designation of this book as a recommendable book by the Japan Library Association, and it is now available in libraries throughout Japan. It is also my great pleasure to see that copies were reprinted in the short span of six months thanks to the enthusiastic interest of its readers.

This book also draws keen attention in Korea. As a result, the Korean version was published in 2008 and additional copies were subsequently re-printed in the following year.

I am delighted as co-author to see the publication of the English edition. I hope it will be greeted with similar welcome as was shown for the Japanese and Korean editions.

Also, as any comment and feedback on this book is welcome, please feel free to share them with me at the e-mail address below.

October 2009

Park Byoung-sup

half-moon@muji.biglobe.ne.jp

Note to the Reader

I. Romanization

1. Romanization for Korean names is based on the "Revised Romanization of Korean," developed by the National Institute of the Korean Language and released to the public by the Korean Ministry of Culture and Tourism on July 7, 2000.

Romanization of "Dokdo" is in accordance with Notice No. 2000-8 by the Korean Ministry of Culture and Tourism. As Dokdo contains "do," a suffix meaning island, "Dokdo Island" is redundant and should not be used.

Romanization of Dongdo and Seodo follows the Notice No. 2005-3, developed by the Presidential Commission on True History for Peace in Northeast Asia. The correct Romanization is Dongdo and Seodo. If necessary, "Dongdo (East Island)" and "Seodo (West Island)" may be used.

When an English modifier is used to signify that Dokdo, Dongdo and Seodo are islands, Dokdo and the noun "island" should always appear in the singular form and "islet" or "rock" should not be used in accordance with the aforesaid Notice No. 2005-3.

2. Romanization for Japanese names follows the Hepburn Romanization System, with the exception of the use of macron to indicate long vowels (ex. Inshū).

3. There may be different versions of Romanization for certain words

by Korea and Japan (i.e, Joseon (Korea)/Chōsen (Japan)).

II. Korean Proper Nouns

Korean proper nouns are based on the "Translation Guide for Tourists: Examples with Attractions and Information" published by the Korea Tourism Organization; the "Glossary of Korean Studies" (<http://www.aks.ac.kr/glossary>) prepared by the Academy of Korean Studies; and the "English Thesaurus for Korean History" developed by the National Institute of Korean History.

III. Naming of Dokdo

In Korea, Dokdo has been known by various names including Usando, Sambongdo, Gajido, and Seokdo, but Seokdo and Dokdo came to be better known by the public since the late 19th century. The Japanese used the name Takeshima for Ulleungdo and Matsushima for Dokdo, while it had referred to Dokdo as Liancourt Rocks around and after the late 19th century. Since 1905, Dokdo has been called Takeshima in Japan.

IV. Record of Dates

As of 1896, Korea officially adopted the Gregorian calendar, and Japan did so as of 1873. All events occurring prior to the respective dates are recorded based on the lunar calendar.

V. Distance Measurement

In this book, Korean 1-ri is equivalent to 0.4 km, while Japanese 1-ri is equivalent to 4 km. (Japanese 1-ri is equal to Korean 10-ri).

CONTENTS

Message from the Publisher	3
Preface to Japanese Edition	5
Preface to English Edition	8
Note to the Reader	10

Chapter I

Japan's Claim to Its Sovereignty over Dokdo/Takeshima

1. Is Takeshima/Dokdo Japan's Inherent Territory? (Naitō)	17
2. Is Dokdo/Takeshima Japan's Inherent Territory? (Park)	38

Chapter II

Historical Controversial Points Concerning Dokdo/Takeshima

1. Ahn Yong-bok in Oki (Naitō)	67
2. Controversy over the Permit for Voyages to Matsushima (Park)	88
3. The Meiji Government's Decree to Exclude Dokdo/Takeshima from Japanese Territory (Park)	95
4. Sailing Directories and Demarcation of the National Boundary in the Meiji Era (Park)	105
5. Dokdo/Takeshima and Usando in Books Published in the Joseon Period (Park)	113
6. "Seokdo" in the "Imperial Ordinance" Issued by the Korean Government (Park)	159
7. Historical Verification of the Takeshima/Dokdo Issue (Naitō)	171

Chapter III

Topics Regarding the Dokdo/Takeshima Issue

1. Comment on Sakurai Yoshiko's Article (Park)	211
2. A Questionnaire Submitted to the Asahi Shimbun (Park)	232
3. Noteworthy Aspects Concerning the Shimane Prefectural Office's Photo Shimane No. 161 (Park)	237
4. Objections to Shimane Prefectural Office's Takeshima Report (Naitō)	245
5. Settlement Through the International Court of Justice or According to International Law (Park)	263

Chapter IV

About Dokdo/Takeshima

1. Information on Dokdo/Takeshima	277
2. A Travelogue about a Visit to Ulleungdo and Takeshima/Dokdo (Gin)	279
3. Is Dokdo/Takeshima Visible from Ulleungdo? (Park)	295

Chapter V

References

1. A Memorandum Concerning the Arrival of a Korean Boat to the Seashore in the 9th Year of the Genroku (1696) (Naitō)	301
2. Dajōkan's Decree to Put "Takeshima and Another Island" Outside Japanese Territory (Urushizaki)	311
3. A Confidential Document Sent by the U.S. Embassy in Tokyo (Park)	330
4. Chronology Concerning Dokdo/Takeshima	337

Notes	349
-------	-----